

የኢትዮጵያ ፌዴራሳዊ ዴሞክራሲያዊ ሪፐብሊክ የፌዴራል ዋና አዲተር መ/ቤት





Ministry of Finance

Addis Ababa

Re: Submission of the 2013 EFY ESPES-AF/IPF Annual audit report

It is to be recalled that the Ethiopian Government and the Development Partners (including IDA) have reached an agreement regarding the annual audit of Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable service - Additional Financing (ESPES AF/IPF) project annual audit to be carried out and a summarized audit report to be submitted to MoF by the Office of the Federal Auditor General.

We have, therefore, attached here with 31 pages of the 2013 EFY ESPES-AF/IPF Annual audit report.

Furthermore, we also request the ministry to develop and submit action plan to rectify the audit findings.

We welcome any enquiries on the audit report.

Sincerely yours

FINANCIAL PROJECT THE REPORT ON AUDITOR'S INDEPENDENT OF THE FINANCE MINISTRY OF THE OF STATEMENTS AND ADDITIONAL FINANCING FOR DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA ENHANCING SHARED PROSPERIT THROUGH EQUITABLE SERVICE PROGRAM /ESPES-AF/ PROJECT

Financial accompanying Operation audited the Financing for Enhancing Additional Statements of Prosperity through Equitable Service (ESPES-AF) component of the Ministry of Finance of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia for the year ended 7 July 2021, which has been financed by IDA Financing agreements IDA D2290.

The preparation of the Project Financial Statements (PFSs) is the responsibility of the Ministry of Finance. This audit is a special purpose audit for Additional Financing for Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable service /ESPES-AF/ of project component /Investment project financing/ whose terms of reference are those given in the Terms of Reference for the Additional Financing for Enhancing Shared Prosperity thought Equitable Service /ESPES-AF/. These Terms include, inter alia, our responsibility to express an opinion on the Project Financial Statements based on our audit and inappropriate expenditure and other on material pertinent matters.

We conducted our audit in accordance with the International Standards on Auditing (ISA) issued by the International Auditing and Assurance Standards Board of the International Federation of Accountants with special reference to ISA 800 and the World Bank relevant Guidelines for the World Bank financed projects.

These Standards requires that we plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance that the financial statements are free from material misstatement. Our audit includes examining on a sample test basis of the evidence supporting the amounts Demr. and disclosures in the Financial Statements. Our auditorad & out of the statements o Der Ethiopia

The Federal Auditor

1

includes assessing the accounting principles used and significant estimates made by management as well as evaluating the overall financial statement presentation. We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our audit opinion.

In our opinion, the Project /Investment project Financing/
Financial Statements present fairly, in all material
respects, the financial position as at 7 July 2021 and the
cash receipts and disbursements for the year then ended of the
Additional Financing for Enhancing Shared Prosperity through
Equitable Service /ESPES/ the project component /Investment
Project Financing/ of the Ministry of Finance of the
Government of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
which were prepared on a modified cash basis and in accordance
with the accounting policy of the Government of the Federal
Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.

Emphasis of matters:

- Perdiem payments of birr 35,378.00 were made double at the same days and for the same individuals improperly in Environment and Climate change Commission.
- Additional birr 164,165.00 Perdiem was paid for local training participants for whom full accommodation (breakfast, lunch, dinner and bed service) was fully covered at Blue Nile Resort Hotel at Bahir Dar City in Federal Ethics and anticorruption Commission.

In addition, in our opinion, in all material respects:

• During the year, all external financing has been used in accordance with the conditions of the relevant financing agreements and only used for the purposes for which the financing was provided; except for the matter disclosed in the emphasis of matter paragraph and management letter octatic Republic

- Counterpart funds have been provided and used in accordance with the relevant financing agreements and only for the purposes for which they were provided;
- Goods, works and services financed under the Project have been procured in accordance with the relevant financing agreements including specific provisions of the World Bank Procurement policies and procedures;
- The necessary supporting documents, records and accounts have been maintained in respect of all project activities, including expenditures /transfers reported in Interim Unaudited Financial Reports (IFRs). In addition, the IFRs issued during the audit were in agreement with the underlying books of accounts except for the matter disclosed in the emphasis of matter paragraph and management letter.
- Designated Accounts have been maintained in accordance with the provisions of the relevant financing agreements, and funds disbursed out of the accounts were used only for the purpose intended in the financing agreement; except for the matter disclosed in the emphasis of matter paragraph and management letter
- National laws and regulations have been complied with and that the financial and accounting procedures approved for the Project were followed and used; except for the matter disclosed in the emphasis of matter paragraph and management letter.
- Financial performance of the project was satisfactory; and
- Assets procured from project funds existed and there was verifiable ownership by the implementing agencies or beneficiaries in line with the financing agreement except for the matter disclosed in the emphasis of matter paragraph and management letter.

MINISTRY OF FINANCE OF GOVERNMENT OF FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA ENHANCING SHARED PROSPORITY THROUGH EQUITABLE SERVICE-AF, INVESTMENT PROJECT FINANCING POJECT CONSOLIDATED STATEMENT OF FINANCIAL POSITION AS Of 7 JULY 2021.

		7 July 2021	7 July 2019
	Notes	Birr	Birr
ASSETS			
CURRENT ASSETS			
Cash balances	3	90,444,481.11	389,742,505.00
Advances	4	146,028,296.68	20,103,220.00
Total current		236,472,777.79	409,845,725.00
Assets			
CURRENT LIABILITIES			
Account Payable	5	18,855,258.96	1,226,690.00
NET CURRENT ASSETS		217,617,518.83	408,619,036.00
REPRESENTED BY			
ACCUMULATED FUND		217,617,518.83	408,619,036.00



MINISTRY OF FINANCE OF GOVERNMENT OF FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA, CONSOLIDATED STATEMENT OF SOURCES AND USES OF FUNDS FOR THE YEAR ENDED 7, JULY 2021

	For the year ended 7 July 2021 Note Birr	For the year ended 7 July 2019 Birr
Opening Balance Beginning Balance Adjustment Source	243,037,079.46 0.00	0.00 0.00
From IDA D2290	424,392,424.91	487,147,837.05
Gain on foreign Exchange	42,918,745.27	3,633,249.70
Total Fund Available	710,348,249.64	490,781,086.75
Total Project Expenditure	492,635,504.23	82,162,050.93
Excess of Financing over Expenditure	217,712,745.41	408,619,035.82

Note:

Expenditure of Bank Service charge amounting ETB 971,464.05 is included in this report.



THROUGH EQUITABLE MINISTRY OF FINANCE ENHANCING SHARED PROSPERITY SERVICE-AF, INVESTMENT PROJECT FINANCING STATEMENT OF FUND FLOW FOR THE JULY 07/2021 YEAR ENDED DOLLAR ACCOUNT NO. 0100101300551

7 JULY 2021

01001013000551

Account Number		NBE
Depository Bank		Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
Address		USD and Birr
Currency		
	Amount in USD	Amount in Birr
OPENINIG BALANCE	1,803,252.90	63,189,047.15
Fund Received From: Inte. Development Association (IDA) D2290	11,304,965.81	424,392,424.91
Total	13,108,218.71	487,581,472.06
Deducted –Transfer and Expenditure		
Transfer to Birr account-	9,800,000.00	387,614,155.95
	2,950,000.00	112,835,905.00
Transfer to MOF-finance	0.00	971,464.05
Bank charges		
Total transfer and Expenditure	12,750,000.00	<u>501,421,525.00</u>
Closing balance	358,218.71	(13,840,052.94)
Actual exchange rate to date	÷	15,701,872.36
	-	29,541,925.30
Add gain or loss on foreign exchange rate		
Closing balance after Gain or loss on foreign		45 704 072 20
exchange	-	15,701,872.36
		(00)

Note:-

For the year ended

The Closing exchange rate used for ending balance(July 7/2021) is 1USD=43.8332

Note: Expenditure of Bank Service charge amounting ETB 971,464.05 is included in this ionia

report.

MINISTRY OF FINANCE

Government of Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Enhancing Shared Prosperity Through Equitable Service-AF, Investment Project Financing

Birr ACCOUNT NO. 0100101040697 For the year ended 7 July, 2021

BIRR

BIRR

OPENING BALANCE

64,066,172.55

64,066,172.55

Add: Transfer from Special Account:-

Transfer from DA Account

501,421,525.00

501,421,525.00

Fund Available for use:-

565,487,697.55

Less:- Transfer and Expenditure

Transfer to Regions:-

Tigray	12,185,844.90
Afar	9,515,696.92

Ambara	23,366,031.53
Amhara	

Oromia	51,574,410.78
Olollila	

Benshangul Gumuz	6,619,222.99

	32,745,335.20
SNNPR	32,743,333.20

	5,079,452.40
Sidama	3,073,432.40
Sluallia	

Gambella	8,590,670.36

Harari	3,118,032.04
Harari	

Addis Ababa	22,340,667.52		
Audis Ababa			

Transfer to Federal Implementers:-

Administration Agency (FPPPAA)	7,393,040.00
Administration , Best J. Co. and Anticorruntion	

Transfer to Federal Ethics and Anticorruption	
The state of the s	20,922,500.00
Commission (FEACC)	

Trans	fer to Environment Forest and Climate Change	
Cami	mission (FECC)	

7

Transfer to Central Statistical Agency (CSA)	88,483,999.60	
Transfer to Ethiopian Institute of Ombudsman (EIO)	18,227,382.16	
Transfer to Ministry of Education (MOE)	6,500,000.00	
Transfer to Ministry of Health (MOH)	20,717,789.82	
Transfer to Ministry of Agriculture (MOA)	7,000,000.00	
Transfer to Ministry of Water, irrigation and Energy (MOWIE)	12,726,400.00	
Transfer to Office of Federal Auditor General (OFAG)	9,947,367.45	
Transfer to MoF-Public Expenditure Mgt. and Control Reform (EMCP)	•	
Transfer to MoF-Channel 1 Program Coordinating Directorate (COPCD)	149,335,905.00	
Total transfer	551,394,380.95	
Expenditures:-	-	
Bank Services Charges	971,464.05	
Total transfer & expenditure	<u>552,365,845.00</u> -	552,365,845.00

Note:-The Closing exchange rate used for ending balance(July 7/2021) is 1USD=43.8332

Closing balance



13,121,852.55

MINISTRY OF FINANCE GOVERNMENT OF THE FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA ENHANCING SHARED PROSPORITY THRUOGY EQIUTABLE SERVICE (ESPES) AND ADDITIONAL FINANCING FOR ESPES DECLARATION OF NON-PROCUREMENT OF MATERIAL ASSETS FOR THE YEAR ENDED 7, JULY 2021

We hereby declare that there were no procurements acquired or procured to date that worth (i) works, estimated to cost fifty million dollar equivalent or more per contract; (ii) goods, estimated to cost thirty million dollar equivalent or more per contract; (iii) non-consulting services, estimated to cost thirty million dollar equivalent or more per contract; (iv) consultant's services, estimated to cost fifteen million dollar equivalent or more per contract with the project funds financed by donors.

mocratic Republic

MINISTRY OF FINANCE GOVERNMENT OF THE FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA ENHANCING SHARED PROSPERITY THROUGH EQUITABLE SERVICES (ESPES) AND ADDITIONAL FINANCING FOR ENHANCING SHARED PROSPERITY THROUGH EQUITABLE SERVICE NOTES TO THE PROJECT FINANCIAL STATEMENTS FOR THE YEAR ENDED 7, JULY 2021

1. BACKGROUND

With the objective of expanding access and improving the quality of basic services Education, Health, in Agriculture, Water and Sanitation and Rural Roads delivered by sub-national governments /woredas/Town Administration and strengthening financial transparency and accountability in service delivery and program for result, the Government of Ethiopia and the World Bank signed the Additional Financing for Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Service /that aim to provide financing to activities related to the Original program/ which commenced in September 29, 2017. This Financing Agreement has two parts, the Program and the project which jointly referred as the" Operation". The operation is implemented by MoF and the project discussed as below:

Project /IPF/: It is a Grant portion of the operation that aim to improve the performance of basic service system through providing Goods, consulting service, non-consulting service and Financing the Operation Cost.

2. SIGNIFICANT ACCOUNTING POLICIES

The principal accounting policies adopted by the Project which are consistent with those applied in the preceding period, are stated below:

a) BASIS OF PREPARATION:

i) These Financial Statements have been prepared based on a modified cash basis in accordance with the accounting Republic

1

policy of the Government of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.

ii) The Operation Financial Statement of the Project for reporting consolidated transactions.

a) CURRENCY:

These financial statements are presented in birr. Transactions in foreign currency are translated into birr at the approximate rate of exchange prevailing at the date of the transaction.



Ministry of Finance

Government of Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Enhancing Shared Prosperity Through Equitable Service-AF, Investment Project Financing

Notes to the consolidated Financial Statements 7, July 2021

		,, bus	ry 2021	
3.	Cash on hand an	d at bank		Birr
	Balance in Do	lar account No.	0100101300551	15,701,872.36
		rr account No.	0100101040697	13,121,852.55
Bank				28,823,724.91
	Balance at Imp Cash on	lementer:-		
hand	Cash at		148,145.39	
bank	Total		61,472,610.81	
Cash	Balance		61,620,756.20	90,444,481.11
4. A	dvances			90,444,481.11 Total
	Tigray	_		-
	Afar	1,001,897.60		1,001,897.6
	Amhara	143,072.05		143,072.1
	Oromia	131,781.20		131,781.2
	Somalie	-		-
	Benshangul	544,503.90		544,503.9
	SNNPR	881,069.94		881,069.9
	Sidama	7,786.56		7,786.6
	Gambella	_		-1
	Harar	118,218.00		118,218.0
	DireDawa	=		-
	Addis Ababa	136,841.34		136,841.3
	FPPPA	9,200.99		9,201.0
	FEACC	0.02		0.0
	EFCC	460,086.55		460, 08 Cratic Republic
		1	2	96,91

	CSA	13,619,645.32		13,619,645.3
	EIO	46,671.43		46,671.4
	MOE	_		-
	МОН	9,097,200.82		9,097,200.8
	MOA	83,000.00		83,000.0
	WDC	-		-
	OFAG	378,098.62		378,098.6
	MOF-EMCP	81,270.40		81,270.4
	MOF-COPCD	119,287,951.94		119,287,951.9
5. F	TOTAL Accounts ole	146,028,296.68	-	146,028,296.68
	Tigray	-	_	<u></u>
	Afar	151,463.00		151,463.00
	Amhara	119,468.10		119,468.10
	Oromia	519.08		519.08
	Somalie	-		-
	Benshangul	76,724.00	-	76,724.00
	SNNPR	1,277,849.18	-	1,277,849.18
	Sidama	-		
	Gambella	-		_
	Harari	44,739.52		44,739.52
	DireDawa	-		-
	Addis Ababa	380,604.76		380,604.76
	FPPPA	7,754.19		7,754.19
	FEACC	_		-
	EFCC	57,122.55		57,123
	CSA	10,216,234.81		10,216,235
	EIO	1,562,734.15		1,562,734 genocratic F

TOTAL	18,855,258.96	-	18,855,258.96
MOF-COPCD	-		-
MOF-EMCP	-		=
OFAG	558,573.82		558,573.82
WDC	12,391.42		12,391.42
MOA	37,880.40		37,880.40
МОН	4,351,199.98		4,351,199.98
MOE	_		-

Total Ending balance

Democratic Republic

Democratic Republic

Office of the Federal Auditor

217,617,518.83

-

Ministry of Finance

Government of Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
Enhancing Shared Prosperity Through Equitable Service-AF, Investment
Project Financing

Note to the Consolidated Financial Statements
At 07, July 2021

7. Expenditure of IPF

Personal Services

106,087,755.78

Goods and Services

364,037,103.47

Fixed Assets

22,510,644.98

Total

492,635,504.23





GOVERNMENT OF THE FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA
THE OPERATION, BOTH THE PROGRAM AND THE PROJECT
A RECONCILATION OF AMOUNTS "RECEIVED BY THE PROJECT FROM THE
DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS (INCLUDING THE WORLD BANK)" WITH THOSE
SHOWN AS BEING "DISBURSED BY THE DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS
(INCLUDING THE WORLD BANK)"

No	Development partners (including the World Bank)	Amounts "Disbursed by the Development partners (including the world Bank)"	Amounts "Received by the Project"	Understa ted amount Received by the Operatio	OPERATION	Remark
1	International Development Association (IDA) D2290	USD 11,304,965.81	USD 11,304,965.81	-	Project	Advance

Note:

• International Development Association (IDA): Grant Number D2290-ET



MINISTRY OF FINANCE OF THE FEDERAL DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF ETHIOPIA ENHANCING SHARED PROSPERITY THROUGH EQUITABLE SERVICE-AF, INVESETEMNET PROJECT FINANCING AUDIT FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND MANAGEMENT RESPONSES ON THE ACCOUNTS FOR THE YEAR ENDED 7 JULY 2021

I. INTRODUCTION

We conducted the audit under the power conferred upon the Office of the Federal Auditor General by Proclamation Number 982/2016(as amended 1146/2019). Our audit followed the audit requirements included in the Terms of Reference (ToR) for the audit of ESPES and Investment project Financing for the year ended 7 July 2021 (Sene 30,2013 E.C).

This report deals with the findings and recommendations which came to our attention during our normal audit procedures which were designed primarily with a view to the expression of our opinion on the Project Financial Statements (PFS) of Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Service program.

The audit was conducted on a test basis and, thus, our audit cannot be expected to disclose all possible weaknesses in internal controls and all other findings which a more extensive special examination might reveal.

II. BACKGROUND

The relevant Financing Agreements between the Government of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia and the Financiers for ESPES -AF, investment project financing is:

• International Development Association (IDA) Financing Agreements IDA D2290

III. SCOPE OF THE AUDIT

a) The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards on Auditing (ISA) issued by the International Auditing and Assurance Standards Board of the International Federation of Accountants, with special

reference to ISA 800 (Auditor's Report on Special Purpose Audit Engagements) and relevant World Bank Guidelines. The audit, accordingly, included such tests of accounting records, transaction, internal controls, and other procedures as were considered essential for the performance of this audit.

- b) In conducting this audit, we have carried out interim and validation audits at Zones and Regions of Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Service -AF, investment project financing that such review ensured that the financial managements were reasonably accurate, reliable and timely.
- c) Discussions were held with staffs of the Ministry of Finance (MoF) and the Project Implementing Agencies at various Government levels.
- d) The audit opinion is limited to the funds received from the Financiers and the Government and of the expenditures incurred for Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Service (ESPES-AF) Investment project Financing.

IV. FIELD VISITS

In addition to the quarterly interim audit reports already submitted to MoF and then to the Development Partners (including the World Bank) for the year ended 7 July 2021 (Sene 30, 2013), we have also visited the various Implementing Agencies and beneficiaries; in all regions except for Tigray and Addis Abeba City administration of the project at Regional and Zone levels for Project Financial Statements purpose.

- V. OBSERVATIONS, FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
- I. THE REGIONAL STATES IMPLIMENTING AGENCIES
- 1. AFAR NATIONAL REGIONAL STATE
- 1.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMEN

Findings:

- Monthly cash count and verification was not done.
- The Cashier's Cash book was not made available for the audit.
- Perdiem payment settlement forms were not completed properly for per diem payments of birr 102,465.00.

Recommendation:

• We recommended that appropriate corrective action should be taken on the findings promptly as per the government applicable rule and regulation.

Management Response:

- They accepted the recommendation and committed to take corrective actions by preparing proper action plan.
- 1.1.1. FOLLOW UP AUDIT FOR THE 2011 EFY ANNUAL AUDIT REPORT: Findings:
 - Perdiem payments were directly recorded and reported as actual expenditure before the actual required field work was performed.
 - Perdiem settlement forms were not completed properly, that is, the departure, arrival and returning time and place were not indicated, for birr 68,554.50, birr 107,143.00 and birr 68,554.00 in the BoFED channel one program, in the office of the Regional audit Bureau and in the office of Regional Council, respectively.

Actions taken/not taken:

• Appropriate corrective action was not taken on the findings except that per diem payments were recorded and Republic

The Federal

reported as actual expenditure after the actual required field work was performed.

Further Recommendation:

• We again recommend that appropriate corrective action should be taken on the findings.

Management Response:

- They accepted the recommendation and committed to take corrective actions by preparing proper action plan.
- 2. AMHARA NATIONAL REGIONAL STATE
- 2.1 BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Finding:

 Advance payment amounting birr 9,931.52 aged more than 6 months made to the project main cashier for payment of various purpose was neither settled nor returned to the government account.

Recommendation:

 Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly according to the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives.

Management Response:

- The auditee management accepted the recommendation and promised to take corrective actions.
- 3. OROMIA NATIONAL REGIONAL STATE
- 3.1. EAST HARARGE ZONE FINANCE

Findings:

• Fuel consumption was not made by using standard normalization rate figure set by the region BoFEC.

Moreover, addresses of fuel cash receipt provided for payments do not reconcile and relate with field work places.

• Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly according to the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives.

Management Response:

• They accepted the recommendation and agreed to take corrective action in the near future.

3.2. WEST HARERGE ZONE FINANCE

Findings:

- Entertainment payment was made without source document such as work evidence and attendance.
- Periderm payment settlement forms were not completed properly.
- Fuel consumption Control mechanism /standard normalization rate figure/ set by the region BoFEC was not implemented.

Recommendation:

• Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly according to the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives.

Management Response:

- The auditee managements have accepted the recommendation and promised to take corrective actions by preparing proper action plan based on the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives accordingly.
- 4. SOMALI NATIONAL REGIONAL STATE
- 4.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: Findings:

 Some Perdiem payments were directly recorded and reported as actual expenditure before the actual required field work was performed. • Perdiem payment settlement forms were not completed properly for birr 41,850.00 per diem payments made as the forms did not describe places where field work was performed, and date of departure and arrival.

Recommendation:

• Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly according to the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives.

Management Response:

- The auditee managements have accepted the recommendation and promised to take corrective actions by preparing proper action plan based on the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives accordingly.
- 4.1.1. FOLLOW-UP AUDIT FOR THE 2011 EFY ANNUAL AUDIT REPORT Findings:
 - Some perdiem payments were directly recorded and reported as actual expenditure before the actual required field work was performed.
 - Perdiem settlement forms were not completed properly for birr 42,500.00.
 - Perdiem payment amounting birr 8,400.00 was not supported by actual source document.
 - Payments of Birr 18,800.00 made for transport cost were not supported by cash receipt from the supplier.

Actions taken/not taken:

Appropriate corrective action was not taken on the findings except that:

Perdiem payment amounting birr 8,400.00 was supported to Republic Plants
 by source document.

• Payments of birr 18,800.00 made for transport cost were supported by cash receipt from the supplier.

Further Recommendation:

• Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly according to the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives.

Management Response:

- The auditee managements have accepted the recommendation and promised to take corrective actions by preparing proper action plan based on the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives accordingly.
- 5. BENISANGUL-GUMUZ REGIONAL STATE
- 5.1. ASSOSA ZONE FINANCE Findings:
 - Monthly bank reconciliation was not prepared.
 - Cash book was not maintained for the cashier.

Recommendation:

- Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly. Management Response:
- The auditee managements accepted the recommendation and promised to take corrective actions.
- 6. SOUTHERN NATIONS, NATIONALITIES AND PEOPLE'S REGIONAL STATE
- 6.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC COOPERATION

Finding:

• Receivables amounting to birr 363,186.65 were not settled timely.

Recommendation:

• Receivables should be settled timely according to the government finance rules and regulations.

Management Response:

- The management promised to take appropriate immediate corrective action as soon as possible.
- 6.1.1 FOLLOW UP AUDIT FOR THE 2012 EFY ANNUAL AUDIT Finding:
 - Receivables and payables amounting to birr 1,766,194.99 and birr 212,198.20 respectively were not settled timely.

Action taken/ not taken:

Appropriate corrective actions were taken except that:

 Receivables amounting birr 363,186.65 were not settled timely.

Further Recommendation

• We again recommend that appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly as per the government's applicable rules, regulations and guideline.

Management Response:

- The management promised to take appropriate immediate corrective action as soon as possible
- 6.2. GURAGE ZONE FINANCE AND ECONOMIC COOPERATION Findings:
 - Payment of birr 13,800.00 for entertainment service and purchase of Spare-parts was made without cash receipt of the recipient.
 - Perdiem payment of birr 13,300.00 were recorded and reported as direct expenditure before performing the required field work.
 - Training payment of birr 40,000.00 was made without training proposal that depict training title, number and identity of trainees, and date and place where the training was given.

• Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly according to the government's applicable financial administration laws, regulations and directives.

Management Response

• The auditee managements have agreed and promised to take appropriate corrective action as soon as possible.

6.3. WOLAYTA ZONE FINANCE AND ECONOMIC COOPERATION_

Findings:

- Training payment of birr 250.00 was made improperly twice /birr 500.00 instead of birr 250.00/ for a single person on one training day.
- Training payment of birr 16,902.00 was made without training proposal that depict training title, number and identity of trainees, and date and place where the training was given.
- Payment of birr 49,600.00 was recorded and reported with the wrong account code 6271 instead of 6231.
- Entertainment Payment of birr 11,440.00 was made with ordinary cash receipt that has no sequential number, supplier TIN and address.

Recommendation:

• Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly according to the government's applicable financial administration laws, regulations and directives.

Management Response:

• The auditee managements have agreed and promised to take appropriate corrective action as soon as possible.

- 7. SIDAMA REGIONAL STATE
- 7.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC COOPERATION Findings:
 - Birr 252,000.00 transferred for different woredas for local training payment was recorded and reported without receiving relevant documents from the woredas.
 - Local training payment of birr 2,250.00 was made without signature of the recipient on attendance sheet.

• Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly according to the government's applicable rules, regulations and directives.

Management Response:

- The auditee management accepted the recommendation and promised to take corrective action in the near future.
- II. THE FEDEREAL GOVERNMENT IMPLIMENTING AGENCIES
- 1. MINISTRY OF FINANCE
- 1.1. FOLLOW UP AUDIT FOR THE 2011 ANNUAL AUDIT REPORT: Findings:
 - Training Payment amounting of birr 569,800.00 made for Ministry's cafeteria was made without bid and market price assessment.
 - Payment of birr 365,582.63 was made for purchase of computer made by Performa without market assessment.
 Action taken
 - Appropriate corrective was taken on the findings listed above
- 2. ENVIRONMENT, FOREST AND CLIMATE CHANGE COMMISSION Findings:
 - Receivables amounting birr 28,949.62 and birr
 138,096.93 aged from 60 to 90 days and over 90 days
 respectively were not settled timely.



- Payable amounting birr 54,075.71 aged over 90 days was not settled timely.
- Perdiem payments of birr 35,378.00 were made double at the same days and for the same individuals improperly.
- Birr 3,250.00 perdiem was paid for local training participants improperly for the period of the time they were back from the training and were at their normal working place.
- Payment of birr 400,000.00 for local training was recorded and reported by wrong account code 2221101 (6231) instead of account code 2251101 (6271).

- Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly. Management Response:
- They accepted the recommendation and agreed to take corrective actions in the future.
- 3. FEDERAL ETHICS AND ANTI-CORRUPTION COMMISSION Findings:
 - Additional birr 164,165.00 Perdiem was paid for local training participants for whom full accommodation (breakfast, lunch, dinner and bed service) was fully covered at Blue Nile Resort Hotel at Bahir Dar City.
 - Perdiem payments of birr 3,900.00 were made double at the same days and for the same individuals improperly.
 Recommendation:
 - Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly. Management Response:
 - They accepted the recommendation and agreed to take corrective actions in the future.



4. CENTRAL STATISTIC AGENCY

Finding:

• Receivables amounting birr 2,806,931.50, birr 23,367.78 and birr 528,580.62 aged from 31 to 90 days, from 91 to 180 days and from 181 to 365 days, respectively, were not settled timely.

Recommendation:

- Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly.

 Management Response:
- They accepted the recommendation and agreed to take corrective actions in the future.
- 4.1 FOLLOW UP AUDIT FOR THE 2011 ANNUAL AUDIT REPORT Findings:
 - Fuel Payment of birr 1,408.00 was made without writing date on the receipt voucher.
 - Payments made for training, allowance and accommodation amounting of birr 15,300.00, birr 2,280.00 and birr 10,234.12, respectively, were not supported with attendance sheet.

Action taken:

- Appropriate corrective action was taken on the findings
- 5. ETHIOPIAN INSTITUTE OF OMBUDSMAN

Findings:

- Payable amounting of Birr 1,400,000.00 aging more than a year was not settled timely.
- Birr 440,412.84 was expended over the budget allocated. Recommendation:
- Appropriate corrective action should be taken promptly. Management Response:
 - They accepted the recommendation and agreed to take corrective actions in the future.



III. OTEHERS

III.1 FOLLOW UP AUDIT FOR THE 2011 ANNUAL AUDIT REPORT Findings:

MINISTRY OF FINANCE:

- Receivables and payables amounting to birr 4,182,225.65 and birr 143,305.72 respectively aged more than a year were not settled in Amhara region BoFED timely even if the project funds was ended up in December, 2018.
- Receivables amounting to birr 432,018.50 aged more than a year were not settled timely in SNNP region BoFED even if the project funds was ended up in December, 2018.
- Receivables and Payables aged more than a year amounting to birr 4,649,695.60 and 621,372.00 respectively were not settled timely in MoF even if the project/PBS III/ was closed in December 2018

CENTRAL STATISTIC AGENCY

- Receivables amounting birr 264,648.16 were not settled since 2007 EFY.
- Fuel payment of birr 125,448.80 that was made in 2007 EFY by Mizan branch office was settled after four years in 2011 EFY.

Action taken/ not taken:

Appropriate corrective action was taken on the finding except that:

 Receivables amounting birr 264,648.16 were not settled since 2007 EFY.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Finally, we would like to express our appreciation to the management and staff of all auditees at various levels for the assistance and cooperation extended to us during the course of the audit.

We would be pleased to provide any further explanations that could be deemed necessary.



Annex I

List of Bureaus, Woredas, Town Administrations and Federal Government Implementing agencies covered in this Annual audit:

- 1. AFAR NATIONAL REGIONAL STATE
 - 1.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMEN
- 2. AMHARA NATIONAL REGIONAL STATE
 - 2.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
- 3. OROMIA NATIONAL REGIONAL STATE
 - 3.1. EAST HARARGE ZONE FINANCE
 - 3.2. WEST HARERGE ZONE FINANCE
- 4. SOMALI NATIONAL REGIONAL STATE
 - 4.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
- 5. BENISANGUL-GUMUZ REGIONAL STATE
 - 5.1. ASSOSA ZONE FINANCE
- 6. SOUTHERN NATIONS, NATIONALITIES AND PEOPLE'S REGIONAL STATE
 - 6.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC COOPERATION
 - 6.2. GURAGE ZOFED
 - 6.3. WOLAYTA ZOFED
- 7. SIDAMA REGIONAL STATE
 - 7.1. BUREAU OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC COOPERATION
- 8. THE FEDEREAL GOVERNMENT IMPLIMENTING AGENCIES
 - 8.1. MINISTRY OF FINANCE
 - 8.2. ENVIRONMENT, FOREST AND CLIMATE CHANGE COMMISSION
 - 8.3. FEDERAL ETHICS AND ANTI-CORRUPTION COMMISSION
 - 8.4. CENTRAL STATISTIC AGENCY
 - 8.5. ETHIOPIAN INSTITUTE OF OMBUDSMAN

